

# CAECILIA

*A Review of Catholic Church Music*



## **The Vernacular In Christian Worship**

**Walter E. Buszin**

VOL. 91, NO. 4

WINTER, 1965

## **CAECILIA**

**Published four times a year, Spring, Summer, Autumn and Winter.**

**Second-Class Postage Paid at Omaha, Nebraska**

**Subscription Price—\$3.00 per year**

**All articles for publication must be in the hands of the editor, 3558 Cass St., Omaha 31, Nebraska, 30 days before month of publication.**

**Business Manager: Norbert Letter**

**Change of address should be sent to the circulation manager:**

**Paul Sing, 3558 Cass St., Omaha 31, Nebraska**

**Postmaster: Form 3579 to Caecilia, 3558 Cass St., Omaha 31, Nebr.**

# CAECILIA

*A Review of Catholic Church Music*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editorials .....	135
The Vernacular in Christian Worship—Walter E. Buszin .....	141
Johannes de Tinctoris—Richard J. Schuler .....	143
Review	
Books .....	148
Music .....	151
News-Litter .....	156

VOL. 91, NO. 4

WINTER, 1965

# CAECILIA

*A Quarterly Review devoted to the liturgical music apostolate.*

Published with ecclesiastical approval by the Society of Saint Caecilia in Spring, Summer, Autumn and Winter. Established in 1874 by John B. Singenberger, K.C.S.G., K.C.S.S. (1849-1924).

Editor ..... Very Rev. Msgr. Francis P. Schmitt

## CONTRIBUTING EDITORS

Francis A. Brunner, C.Ss.R.  
Louise Cuyler  
David Greenwood  
Paul Koch  
Paul Manz  
C. Alexander Peloquin

Elmer Pfeil  
Richard Schuler  
Lavern Wagner  
Roger Wagner  
Abbot Rembert Weakland, O.S.B.  
James Welch

## CAECILIA ASSOCIATES

Dr. Caspar Koch, Pittsburgh, Pa.	The Hon. Arthur Reilly, Boston, Mass.
Sr. Alphonse Marie, C.P.P.S., O'Fallon, Mo.	Eugene Leahy, Notre Dame, Ind.
Alfred Bichsel, Rochester, N.Y.	Emmanuel Leemans, Boys Town, Nebr.
Cornelius Bouman, Nijmegen, Holland	Edward Malone, O.S.B., Elkhorn, Nebr.
Martin Bush, Omaha, Nebr.	Dom Gregory Murray, Downside Abbey, England
George Carthage, St. Cloud, Minn.	Flor Peeters, Mechelen, Belgium
Sr. Casimir, O.P., Omaha, Nebr.	Rev. Fred Reece, Stuart, Ia.
Rev. Charles Dreisoerner, San Antonio, Tex.	Myron Roberts, Lincoln, Nebr.
Rev. Laurence Feininger, Trento, Italy	Sr. Rosalie, O.P., Hastings, Nebr.
Winifred Flanagan, Omaha, Nebr.	Dom Ireneo Segarra, Montserrat, Spain
Terence Gahagan, London, England	Eugene Selhorst, Rochester, N. Y.
Rev. Ferdinand Haberl, Regensburg, Germany	Frank Szynskie, Boys Town, Nebr.
Anton Heiller, Vienna, Austria	Sr. Theophane, O.S.F., Milwaukee, Wisc.
Paul Hume, Washington, D.C.	Irvin Udulutch, O.F.M., Marathon, Wisc.
Ralph Jusko, Cincinnati, O.	Omer Westendorf, Cincinnati, O.
Aloysius Knoll, O.F.M. Cap., Herman, Pa.	Rev. Russell Woollen, Washington, D.C.
Ernst C. Krohn, St. Louis, Mo.	John Yonkman, Ft. Wayne, Ind.
Jean Langlais, Paris, France	

Managing Editor ..... Norbert T. Letter  
Library ..... Ferenc Denes  
Circulation ..... Paul Sing

Subscription Price: \$3.00; Additional Single Copy 75¢

Editorial and Business Address: 3558 Cass St., Omaha 31, Nebraska

## EDITORIALS

### *Vale Atque Ave*

This is the last issue of CAECILIA as such. The Spring issue of the new journal will appear under the auspices of the Church Music Association of America as No. 1 of Volume 92. Your subscription to CAECILIA will be honored by the Association's editorial board until it has expired. If you subscribe to both the CHOIRMASTER and CAECILIA, you will be credited for both, although it would aid the financing of the new venture if you would settle for the duration of one subscription or the other. Membership in the Church Music Association is now divided into three groups, all of which are entitled to receive the journal: voting members (fee \$10) student members (fee \$4), and members by subscription (fee \$5). To be a voting member one must be a church musician and recommended by two voting members of the society and then approved by the membership committee, which is chairmaned by Sister Theophane of Alverno College, Milwaukee. It goes without saying that your editor hopes that all readers of CAECILIA will apply for one or the other of the memberships, and do a little saleswork besides, for the new journal, if it is to serve a broader purpose than its predecessors obviously have, must get into the hands of as many of the clergy and laity as possible. He should also like to express his deepest personal appreciation to his collaborators. The shortcomings of the magazine during his tenure can be traced largely to his having failed to badger them consistently enough for material. None but himself can know how ready their response was when he did. He must thank again those organizations and individuals who subsidized the journal too: all of us can tell you that the fees set by the new association are minimal. Finally, he would like to ask the forgiveness of those whom he has offended, even when this was done wilfully. That said, he begs leave to send a few parting salvos to nobody in particular.

### *Aggiornamento*

The editorial in the winter issue, about what ought to happen but what might, was, of course, all wet. Not that there was anything malicious in the misinformation we winged so brazenly across the land. We were simply out-aggiornamented. There was a shift in the wind when the joint instruction of the S.R.C. and the P.C.C.

came out, inserting the note of the ministers' sung parts being approved by the territorial bodies. I first ran across this in Boise, which I plead, was a couple of weeks this side of Medicine Hat. Even then, in the light of preceding documents, the situation was not clear, although it would appear that the snow-makers at the publishing centers must have had some advance notice of the later interpretation of the P. C. C., which left the approval of everything but the minister's parts up to the ultimate units of collegiality. (One simply must assume that the schola, cantor, lector, commentator, loud-speaker, trustee, and people of God generally have not, in the new dispensation, arrived at ministerial status.) At this writing there is no word from Detroit about the ministers sung parts, and who would so play the fool as to advise anyone? But a lot of people besides Denis have already published varieties as multiple as mid-summer weeds, and it is too late now not to reap the wild wind.

### *Exit: Gregorian Chant*

CAECILIA has, since its inception ninety years ago, devoted generous space to discussing the chant. Of late years it has been especially guilty of publicly airing the problem of rhythm. We have at hand a recently published book by John Rayburn, (*Gregorian Chant: A History of the Controversy Concerning Its Rhythm*, available from McLaughlin and Reilly Company, 252 Huntington Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts. \$2.50.) It contains a fine bibliography and is as good a survey of the matter as we have seen—if not the only detailed survey available to the English reader. It was, as we understand it, admitted as a doctoral dissertation at Columbia University. Because Dr. Rayburn, a notable New York choir-master, draws considerably upon past issues of CAECILIA, it would perhaps be indelicate for this writer to review it further. Anyway, we have no desire to prolong an argument whose interest becomes more and more academic, nor to start a new one, although we confess to being startled at the sprinkling of ictus in both chant adaptations and imitative pieces that go by the name of chant, sometimes called American.

What we seriously begin to question, though, is the whereabouts of those vigorous champions of the several schools of yesteryear. If Pothier and Mocquereau had not gotten around to saying hello to each other beyond the gates ere 1965, I suspect that they are holding each other's head in commiseration now. And I can see Father Vitry spitting out some of the brandy he used to take to rid himself of the taste of Solesmes. Father Pierron would be around,

too, bright-eyed, and cackling at the joke. Of course one cannot properly appraise the Gregorian situation until the new books are out, but for a long time now we have all of us been too giddy joining the debunkers of the legend which had the Holy Ghost perched atop St. Gregory's shoulder as he penned the melodies which took his name. The inspiration was not his, nor did it have a biblical sense, but to have lost the conviction that there was inspiration of the noblest sort is nothing short of tragic. I for one confess that it provided, and provides, about the only kind of mental prayer that I have known—even when reciting the varied mysteries of the rosary. I do not say that Gregorian is meat for everybody, but let no one say that it is meat for nobody. I am very sure that were it not for the general musical decline that has set in since the chant restoration, a decline that continues with a devastating thrust, the chant would not now be despised as something not pastoral. I am sure because even now, in my own milieu, I can teach it to the utterly unlettered, make it the basis of a whole musical structure. I am sure because in my own boyhood we were taught singing every day, not by specialists, but by whoever happened to be teaching anything. I never attended a high mass when the Gregorian propers were not sung, albeit the Medicean ones, and one need not have been an especially perceptive child to have caught the especial meaning of the "*Lumen ad Revelationem Gentium*", the "*Gloria Laus*", the "Jerusalem" responsories of *Tenebrae* (we were not a "religious" parish) the sung Latin Litany of Loretto during fecund May, and the great chant break-throughs of Holy Saturday morning (the running favorites for killing, meaningless daily fare).

Monastic, scholastic—almost anything descriptive of the vitality of the sparse culture we possess have meanwhile become dirty words, especially among monastics and scholastics. For the first time in my life—there has never been any secret about my yen to have been brave enough to be one of the *fraticelli*—I harbor the wish that I might have been born one, perhaps two, generations hence, when it will surely be clear that not everyone before the age of Küng and Novak was a dope. The best scholar I know says privately—and who wants to brave the new Inquisition?—that the long cold light of history will look kindlier to Trent than Vatican II. This quite apart from ecumenical interests which both of us shared long before it had become the fashion.

Anyway, I am not here concerned with the detractors and professional enemies of the chant. I am mightily concerned about its friends, and begin to wonder how many of them ever really gave

a damn. Father Flanagan once told me that nobody could organize an Irishman. He nor anyone else has ever had any luck organizing *me*. Still I cannot bring myself to despise the notion of a system. Surely that is, above all, what we lack. There was that joke about the American hierarchy, reported during the first session of Vatican II by Father Raymond Bosler, I believe: everyone had come to Rome with ideas, except the Americans, who came with return tickets. I should have hoped that after all the years of jealous guardianship of the official integrity of the chant, and especially after the strictures of the 1958 Instruction (which has become the basis for the denouement of the High Mass) that someone might have said: "This vast treasury belongs to the church. In case you do not know it, it has always been her very own. You do not tinker with it except as the church shall appoint and advise." But nobody did. Worse still, so few respected what was not, but might have been said. And all the still-born offspring of the Medici—Ratisbon and Mechelen and Rheims-Tournai—must be having a terribly good laugh.

Of all the mushroom "chant" publications I have seen, I must, out of a prejudice I owe, be least esevere with those which come from the Precious Blood Sisters, O'Fallon, Missouri. At least they have the flavor of chant. I should not, subject to correction, be inclined to credit them to Father Vitry. His private contractions of the interminable Lenten Tracts made a good deal of sense, even monastic sense. But much of the rest of his work, as I view it, was purely pedagogic, planned to lead less than striplings to the real heights. I do not for a moment begrudge the pastoral consideration which permits recto-tono and psalm-tone arrangements, although I might wish that these had been directed to the ordinary rather than the proper of the Mass. It changes matters little, despite the change of language. But I should be happy to preside over a New England burning of the maudlin imitations of psalming.

My first hearing of English chant was in the Anglican Church of St. Mary the Virgin in New York City, during the musical tenure of Ernest White and Edward Linzel. The immediate impression—especially after having heard the Latin Chant mauled in three or four Roman churches of the same Sunday morning—came close to exultation. And while I have listened to interminable arguments about textual difficulties, and criticism enough of Mr. White's technique, I have come to have far more respect for his efforts, and those of Canon Winfred Douglas, and the few Romans like them, who bear a reverent respect for the integrity of the musical



text. The Anglican community worked laboriously with us for a restoration. The Lutherans have begun with holy impatience to set their sights toward it. Airily, we cast it aside.

### *Enter: Almost Anything*

The other-than-chant picture is possibly even more depressing. Here one wishes that he might reach those to whom chant has never made sense. He should dare to wish so because these people know nothing, care nothing about music, liturgical or otherwise. But they are mightily interested in congregational participation, as the saying goes. Our musicians, judging from the plethora of new Peoples' Masses "in English", "dedicated to Pope John XXIII", "for the People of God" (and the copyright owners), "for Unity", "To Saint Apoplexus", "In Honor of Vatican II", and God knows what, have finally given the lie to their own ineptitude which must always have been there, and which now, exposed, is more glaring than ever. I leave aside the few good craftsmen whose vernacular offerings compare favorably with their Latin settings. For the rest, one can only envision a compulsive contributor sitting at the piano with manuscript paper and the new text, trying to decide whether the next note should go up or down. But none of them, whatever the quality or price, make any contribution to congregational participation. In justice, I am not at all sure that such a contribution can be made. No lost tradition can be restored by fiat, however official. The better ordinaries deserve to be sung in controlled situations, say in schools and convents; but to expect a congregation to essay endless series of intervals, when music has not been an integral part of their education, is like asking a cage full of monkeys to read the arabic alphabet, form words, sentences, periods. Such, however, is the new task which the liturgical pundits require of the choirmaster. Better he resign and join the commentator's corps. He would know, more than most, when to tell the people to please sit and please stand, to please make a joyful noise and please shut up.

As a congregationalist I should, on the whole, be more inclined to look kindly on the fad of liturgical, hip-swinging pop-music.\* The trouble is that in the "world" the pop people know and expect their fate: idols of a generation of two year's life or less. Get them into church and they would likely be canonized if only because their music, paid for, would be on the shelves. Even such a state of

---

\*Cfr., Mr. Walter's review of Erik Routley's "Twentieth Century Church Music". I doubt whether Mr. Walter knows how far the Roman Church has progressed in these matters.

affairs would not be especially deleterious except for the fact that today's pop folk inevitably become square and disgusting to tomorrow's. "Their own music"—let the youngsters and such of their religious mentors as have an incapacity to grow up have it. I think I know as much about these matters as most. My boys canvass the campus with transistors like anybody else. And they would die laughing if it were suggested to them that we manage some sort of Freudian sublimation in matters of worship. Having sung Father Daniel Lord's mission verses to all the old football songs in my own halcyon days, (there was that special one about the football nine crossing the goal line) I doubt whether the church needs so to reach out to our youth, or any other social stratum. Let them and their clerical dance masters have it, and all they want—outside of worship.

When it comes to the total congregation—not just the elusive pop element—I suspect that once we have gotten it vocal, in the sense of a more or less vibrant recitation, the most we can hope to do is elevate the recitation to some sort of recitative, please God a consistent, national even, sort of recitative. That, at least, would involve a congregational commitment to the proper liturgical texts: something vastly superior to the para-liturgical, four-ring circus, symbol-destroying hymns which have less to do with participation than collected Hindu rosary beads. I suppose I seem fairly dismal. Well, I am. A Pandora's box has been let loose upon us which only a gigantic turning back of musical history could cope with. Quite in the same way the chant restoration at the turn of the century required, over all, a turning back of history. But history didn't turn back—not to the 10th century. And it will not now turn back to the 4th or 5th or 6th. From all sides, to all of us, the cry will rise: "You do something about it!" Frankly, I can't. I admit only to some small competence which I can exercise in my own corner. Nothing more. It cannot be transferred by workshop or correspondence course. I thought so long ago, and have come, more often than not, to regret second thoughts.

Francis P. Schmitt

## THE VERNACULAR IN CHRISTIAN WORSHIP

To appear before you to discuss with you the use of the vernacular in the Mass affords me great pleasure indeed. We should always be ready to discuss problems of Christian worship since nothing is of greater consequence to people than the worship of God through Christ Jesus. The entire upheaval which took place in Europe during the 16th century was basically a problem of Christian worship; perhaps one of the great differences between the 16th century and the 20th is that today we talk things over both neutrally and amicably to seek to help one another, whereas in times past we met as it were in an arena to fight things out and to achieve victory through battle and conflict. Also today we differ seriously and even radically, but today we seek to bear in mind even amidst differences that it is good and pleasant to dwell together with understanding and through this understanding to achieve greater unity.

The question of worshipping God with understanding dates back to the early days of the New Testament era. St. Paul devoted almost an entire chapter to this very problem (1. Cor. 14) in the very heart of his discussion on worship (1. Cor. 11-14). The words of Paul are quoted often also by those who have worshipped in the vernacular for centuries, for one can employ the vernacular without making one's self understood. All languages involve difficulties and there will be such difficulties as long as people inhabit the earth. Failing to make ourselves understood is likely due more to inherent nature than to barriers of language. Our sinfulness does not clear up matters; it only bemuddles us more. We learn to understand each other better only through God's boundless grace, for God is not a God of confusion but of peace (1. Cor. 14, 33). It is God's will, therefore, that all things be done for edification (1. Cor. 14, 26). He knows better than we all whether or not, also in the matter before us, we are truly eager for manifestations of the Spirit; if we are, He will enable us to strive to excel in building up the Church (1. Cor. 14, 6) which, let us never forget, is the Bride of Christ.

It is my sincerest hope that your zeal will not prompt you to seek to solve your problem iconoclastically, as did some of the reformers of the 16th century. If I may be so bold as to mention the name of Martin Luther, permit me to mention that, unlike most other reformers of the 16th century, Luther did not strive to throw out the child with the bath. His maxim was: *Quod bonum est tenebimus*—What is good we will retain. He did not reject hymns because they had originated within the Roman Catholic Church,

---

Dr. Buszin is professor of Liturgics at Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, Mo., and editor of *Response*, the Journal of the Lutheran Society for Worship, Music and the Arts. The above article is his own summary of a lecture given at the Boys Town Workshop last August.)

but kept them whenever he could. He did not cast out medieval Christian art with hatred of heart, but in the Preface of the *Geistliches Gesangbüchlein* he said: "I am not of the opinion that because of the Gospel all arts should be rejected violently and vanish, as is desired by the heterodox, but I desire that all arts, particularly music, be employed in the service of Him who has given and created them." Coming back to our problem of languages, Luther said in his *Deutsche Messe und Ordnung des Gottesdienstes* of 1526: "I in no wise desire that the Latin language be dropped from our services of worship." No other reformer of the 16th century expressed such views. That is why we regard Luther not as an extremist or as a radical, but as a man who kept his balance and who sought to separate the chaff from the wheat.

In this same type of spirit I urge you not to get rid of Gregorian chant as though it had seen its day and should now be rejected. After all, five centuries were required to develop this great art and you should never treat it as chaff. Like Luther, you may have to adjust this chant and here and there come down from its highest levels of development, but plainchant is too great to be rejected outright. I am not among those who believe that plainchant and the English language, or any language, are completely incompatible with each other. I need but refer you to the excellent settings of Canon Winfred Douglas to prove my point. Having myself set the Introits for the Church year to music, I, too, can vouch for the fact that they can and do go together.

The same applies, too, to polyphonic Church music. One must make adjustments here and there and these adjustments must be made with discretion, but they can be made. Though, since metrical and rhymed texts are involved, the same may be applied to medieval hymnody, it can be done, as may be seen from the translations of John Mason Neale.

To ask you not to deal with matters hastily and radically is like carrying coals to Newcastle, since your Church has learned to be patient and not to act in undue haste. Many years will be required to complete this work, but it will be worth your while to devote many years to this task. If you do not take your time and will act drastically, you will suffer the same type of tragic consequences which afflict present-day Protestantism and you will lose your precious heritage in music and art. That would be unfortunate indeed, for unworthy or inferior music and art are unworthy of use in the Roman Mass and degrade it. This is all the more tragic because a great purpose of the Mass should always be and remains to glorify God and edify the people.

Walter E. Buszin

## JOANNES DE TINCTORIS: 15TH CENTURY THEORIST AND COMPOSER

No doubt few Catholic church musicians have heard of Joannes de Tinctoris, and most probably few will ever meet with him or his work in the ordinary course of their musical duties. Yet here is a man whose life and talents, spent in the service of the music of the Catholic Church, have placed him high among the masters of polyphony.

Joannes de Tinctoris is hailed as the first great theorist of modern times. He broke with the medieval tradition of music theory which made theoretical treatises speculative discussions belonging rather to philosophy than to the art of practical music. Instead of arguing the place of heavenly bodies in the production of music, Tinctoris attempted to record for later generations the method of writing music used in his own fifteenth century. He was the first one to function in the roll of theorist according to our modern concept of that term, *i. e.*, one who transmits to future ages the method of contemporary technique, not one who formulates rules to be imposed upon another generation of composers.

Little is known for certain about the life of Joannes de Tinctoris, or in Flemish, Johannes de Verwere, and even about those few known facts there is much dispute. It is known, however, that he was born in the Netherlands, that he travelled to Italy to the court of Ferdinand at Naples, and that he returned to his native land. He wrote many theoretical works, all in Latin, and he did some composing, a few of his works being extant today. Most probably he was a priest. Beyond these few facts, his life remains hidden in the fifteenth century.

Two Belgian cities share the claim of being Tinctoris' birthplace: Poperinghe, a town of West Flanders, and Nivelles, in the province of Brabant. Tinctoris himself does not refer to his birthplace, but he does call himself "Brabantinus", and Joannes Trithemius, a contemporary of his as well as his first biographer, in his *Catalogus Illustrium Virorum*, writes of "Joannes Tinctoris ex civitate Nivellesi oriundus." Both Van der Straeten and Weinmann discount the reliability of Trithemius as an accurate historian and consequently do not accept Nivelles as the birthplace, preferring Poperinghe instead. However, Charles van den Borren, the most recent of the musicologists to consider the question, accepts the testimony of Trithemius, and with some corroborating arguments concludes in favor of Nivelles.

Among the tiny scraps of evidence brought together by detailed searching of fifteenth century record books is one piece produced in 1875 by Louis Galesloof, a colleague of Van der Straeten. He found an entry in the Register of the University of Louvain for the year 1471: "M(agister) Joannes Tinctoris, Morinensis dyocesis XVto Maii." A little later Galesloof found an additional entry for the year 1475: "Jacobus Tinctoris, de Poperinghe, Morinensis dyocesis, in artibus XXVta Februarii." The diocese of the Morini mentioned here was an old ecclesiastical division, called from the name of the people themselves rather than after either one of two principal cities within the area in order to avoid a dispute. The bishop lived at Therouanne until its destruction by Charles V in 1553. The town of Poperinghe was within the territory of the Morini: Nivelles belonged to the diocese of Leodinesis. Using this shred of information, Van der Straeten, in his haste to prove that Tinctoris was born in Poperinghe, makes two unwarranted assumptions: first, that Jacobus Tinctoris was the brother of Joannes Tinctoris; second, that since Jacobus was born in Poperinghe, Joannes was also. Charles van den Borren settles the issue by dismissing the entry in the Louvain Register as another man of the same name. Bragard in recent publications agrees with van den Borren, although older writers, including Eitner, Riemann, and Grove's Dictionary follow Van der Straeten.

Not only is Tinctoris' place of birth in dispute; his date of birth is the subject of similar controversy. Some say he was born in 1435; others say 1446. The evidence again is meager, only a sentence from Trithemius, who mentions that Tinctoris was about sixty years old in 1495. Van der Straeten finds this difficult to reconcile with the entry in the Louvain Register, because if Tinctoris were sixty years old in 1495, he would be thirty-five years old when he was a student at Louvain. Eitner suggests that he was there for a course or two as a post-graduate student, thus accounting for the title "M(agister)". Van der Straeten, after much calculating, pushes the birth date back to 1446 in order to make Tinctoris twenty-five when he was at Louvain. Charles van den Borren, who does not accept the Louvain Register as a reference to Tinctoris, quotes from the *Priere pour les chanteurs* of Loyset, which dates from 1470-1475. In it Tinctoris is mentioned among the great musicians. Van den Borren concludes that a man mentioned along with these great musicians would more probably be thirty-five years old than twenty-five. He thus subscribes to the year 1435 as the birth date, as Trithemius suggested. Weinmann and Coussmaker, however, follow Van der Straeten's year, 1446.

Tinctoris journeyed to Italy and held a position in the court of Ferdinand of Aragon, King of Naples. Weinmann says the first safe year for this is 1476, although Van der Straeten says he moved to Naples in 1471, the year he finished at Louvain. Tinctoris describes his position in Naples by the titles he gives himself in his works: *Regis Siciliae cappellanus; in legibus licentiatu; jurisconsultus ac musicus; inter eos, qui jura scientiasque mathematicas profitentur; inter legum artiumque mathematicarum professores; legum artiumque professor; inter musicae professores; magister; cantor.* Lichtenthal says that Tinctoris was founder of the Neapolitan music school, and Fergusson repeats it, but Van der Straeten denies it. Van den Borren cautiously admits that Tinctoris was a *Magister de Capella*.

In 1487 Tinctoris left Naples on a trip across the Alps to recruit singers for the royal chapel in Naples. Edna Sollitt says that he did not return to Naples. Weinmann insists that he did, quoting Tinctoris' own words: "*divino munere feliciter Neapoli regressus sum.*" Others suggest that Tinctoris returned to Naples but did not re-enter the service of Ferdinand, who apparently was a man hard to work under. Trithemius records that Tinctoris was in Italy writing various things in the year 1495. Others have tried to claim that Tinctoris became a member of the papal chapel during the pontificates of Alexander VI and Innocent VIII, but Weinmann could find nothing to substantiate this when he investigated the lists of singers in the archives of the Sistine Chapel, although the lists are incomplete from April, 1494, to February, 1501.

Weinmann claims that Tinctoris died in Naples, and thus he did not return a second time to the Netherlands, even though he had been appointed a canon of Nivelles. In those days prior to the Council of Trent, it was not necessary to be in residence in order to hold those positions. Dufay, in fact, was even dispensed from being present at the installation ceremonies of one of the many prebendaries he held. Van den Borren and others claim that Tinctoris died at Nivelles, and that he thus returned a second time to his native land. There is evidence that a successor was appointed to fill the canon's office held by Tinctoris, the appointment being dated October 12, 1511. Those positions were usually filled quite promptly. All agree that Tinctoris died sometime before October, 1511.

Among the theoretical works of Tinctoris one of the most famous is his treatise on counterpoint, the *Liber de Arte Contrapuncti*. Written in 1477, when he was in residence at the court

of Naples, and dedicated to the king, Ferdinand, this work claims to be based on the contrapuntal practices of the contemporaries of Tinctoris. Mention is made in the prologue of Okeghem, Regis, Busnois, Caron, Fauges, Dunstable, Binchois, and Dufay. Their works, says Tinctoris, "possess such sweetness that they are worthy of the immortal gods." He repudiates the rules and writings of the ancient theorists, and makes these contemporary composers the bases of his treatise. This decision by Tinctoris to study the writers of his own age marks him as a progressive critic, and makes his work of great value as a record of fifteenth century technique.

The *Liber de Arte Contrapuncti* is divided into three sections: the first treats consonances; the second, dissonances; and the third comprises a set of practical rules for the writing or improvising of counterpoint. In the treatment of the consonances, of which he notes twenty-two, Tinctoris observes that his contemporaries use more than did the older writers, because of new instruments and because of the fine voices of the singers of his day. The various consonances are classified into simple and composite, perfect and imperfect, inferior and superior, and through fifteen chapters of the first book each consonance is taken up, defined, and all the progressions possible to the interval listed in great detail.

In the second book, Tinctoris most reluctantly admits that dissonance may justifiably be used in moderation, but the same detail of treatment is not accorded the dissonant intervals which was given to the consonances, probably because Tinctoris thought of dissonances as thoroughly unessential. He distinguishes between simple counterpoint which is note against note, and florid counterpoint, as well as between counterpoint which is written and that which is improvised while singing. The amount of dissonance tolerated depends upon the type of counterpoint being composed, for in simple counterpoint dissonance is absolutely forbidden, while in written florid counterpoint one may use a dissonance but only at a certain point in the measure and then for only a certain duration proportionate to the consonant interval and the length of the note in the cantus. Tinctoris appears to be somewhat reactionary here, even in the face of examples which he quotes from the works of his contemporaries in which dissonance occurs contrary to Tinctoris' writing. He dismisses these "imperfections" of his models with the phrases from Horace that "even Homer sometimes nods."

Book three lists eight rules for the composing of counterpoint which to us today seem very ordinary, but in the fifteenth century must have been a most practical conclusion to a work of this kind.



During the past fifteen years the Universal Society of Saint Cecilia of Rome has issued the *Monumenta Polyphoniae Liturgicae Sanctae Ecclesiae Romanae*, which makes available the manuscripts of the Vatican Library. In the first series to appear were the Masses on the theme "L'homme armé" by the very men mentioned by Tinctoris in his prologue, as well as a Mass by Tinctoris himself on the same cantus. It was a most interesting study to place these Masses alongside the rules of Tinctoris. By counting each use of each consonant progression in the various Masses and comparing the results with these progressions recommended by Tinctoris in his *Liber*, one cannot but note that the observations of Tinctoris agree by and large with the findings in the music of his contemporaries. There was a uniformity of style among the Masses studied which Tinctoris had grasped and recorded.

But Tinctoris, although he is called the first of the modern theorists, did not leave an organized system of harmony. Neither is his *Liber de Arte Contrapuncti* a textbook or a system of study, for the length and extreme detail of its lists of progressions render it quite impractical as a guide for the beginning student of counterpoint. These long lists make assimilation an impossibility. Yet, on reading the work one cannot but be amazed at the extraordinary detail in Tinctoris' account of his contemporaries' practice, as well as the powers of analysis that Tinctoris possessed in order to arrive at his observations. The *Liber* is thoroughly organized and most logically ordered throughout, the work of a man trained in the orderly ecclesiastical studies, and one who is at the same time a learned humanist filled with a love of the classic authors. The value of this book today lies not in its being a textbook, but rather in its being a reflection of the practices of Tinctoris' times, and it is a true reflection as the comparisons with the Masses of the *Monumenta Polyphoniae Liturgicae* have shown.

Because of this priest-musician and his theoretical works, we have another window into the fifteenth century, an age too often passed over because of the overwhelming stature of the music of the sixteenth century giants, and yet an age worthy of study and appreciation because of itself. Its music is not a mere preparation for the masterful polyphony of Josquin, Palestrina, Lassus and the others, but it is music that demands our attention and performance in its own right, for its own beauty and artistry and for the influence that it can exert on contemporary technique of this twentieth century.

Richard J. Schuler

## REVIEW

### *Books*

#### TWENTIETH CENTURY CHURCH MUSIC\*

Erik Routley

Oxford University Press: New York, 1964

214 pp. \$5.00

The author's announced intention is "to stir up interest in contemporary church music, to suggest, perhaps, lines along which future research would be worth pursuing, and to make some broad judgments about the social implications of some of the developments we shall encounter." He succeeds on all counts, though many readers may wonder at his sense of "beginning . . . a conversation" which in fact has been a raging dialogue for a long time in many circles.

Dr. Routley speaks to the whole of the church music world, however, pastor and layman, amateur and professional, musician and parishioner. Again in evidence is his quite wondrous gift for a literary dialect which at once carries sufficient intellectual freight for the professional and communicates, with transparency and engaging wit, difficult theological-sociological-musicological complexes to the lay reader.

Mostly, this is a book about English music. In four rather tedious chapters, the author records the history of that music since the beginning of the century generously providing a reasonable perspective to men and music usually written off as hallowed hacks of the Establishment. This decent task is a struggle, and Routley slips into literary obscurities such as "he preserves what is Presbyterian," or "he has evolved a style in which the truth within the idiom of J. S. Bach is . . . 'demythologized' and presented in a modern context."

Later on, American readers will be introduced to exciting English musicians and compositions probably wholly new to them. An important chapter on *Hymns and Psalms* includes a good list of modern English hymns. Part III surveys the radical styles of new music with perceptive excellence.

---

\* Reprinted with the kind permission of the Editor of *Response*.

Most fascinating are the final chapters, which deal with the protest of the English "pop" experimenters against the traditional image of church music. At present, there is no movement within the U.S. churches which exactly parallels English liturgical "pop". It is coming, however, for the sociological background and mentality which encourages liturgical "pop" is as American as it is English, if not more so. Although Dr. Routley only implies it, the problem (or blessing?) troubles the Continent also. With equanimity, he exposes the self-deception and musical and clerical advocates and foes of the movement, traces its historical evolution, brilliantly analyzes it as a sociological phenomenon of the age, and champions its values with a clarity of argument that is convincing, challenging, and down-right frightening.

These final five chapters are the single most important document appearing on the subject to date. They are recommended reading for all pastors and church musicians, particularly those working with youth groups, social missions, and urban congregations.

Allowing fair concession to the admitted limitations of the study, most non-English readers will be disturbed by the insularity of its defects. Especially is this so since the overall excellence of the work and the distinguished reputation of the author will lend greater significance to the coverage of foreign cultures than is deserved. Dr. Routley's treatment of American music is gracious, and many accurate observations are made. However, even his brief references to composers and church music are drawn only from the Anglican lineage in America, and even there not always important or characteristic choices are made. At least this explains the presence of the dated and false thesis "that the musical culture of the United States extends only to part of the country: the Eastern seaboard and the large centers of population".

France is happily treated for a change, but Sweden, unquestionably one of the most vibrantly creative church music cultures in the world, is dusted off with a passing remark about the earlier hymnological work of Bishop Aulen. Heinz Werner Zimmerman's glorified "pop" rates more space and warmth than Distler, Pepping, Micheelsen, and far more German composers than deserve it are dumped by implication into the Kapellmeister category.

A Bibliographical Index of Music and Musicians and a Discography are included. The type-face familiar to Oxford publications is still an astigmatic nightmare.

William R. Walters

# A PRELIMINARY SURVEY OF ROMAN CATHOLIC HYMNALS PUBLISHED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

By Sr. Mary Camilla Verret, R.S.M.

Published by the Catholic University of America Press,  
Washington, D.C.

If one were to make a quick survey of Catholic hymnals fifty years ago he would probably find that three or four had the greatest popularity. How many were published before or since would be a difficult question to answer. At last through the publication of this survey we can give a highly accurate figure as well as answer to a number of pertinent questions of those interested in the field of American Catholic hymnody. This survey, a Master's thesis, is one of a number of similar bibliographies of American Catholic publications published by the Catholic University Press.

One might be surprised to learn that there are over 300 entries which with enlarged editions and reprints brings the total to over 500 entries. Each entry includes a brief description and wisely includes the place or places where the copy might be seen.

Sister Camilla has made a diligent search and through letters to libraries, religious communities, seminaries and individuals has been able to locate hymnals that might have gone unnoticed in future years. Some of these books have not been located but are recorded through references to advertisements. Extensive as this survey proves to be, Sr. Camilla feels that others might turn up. The writer is aware of a small number and it is hoped that in good time a supplement might be added.

How valuable the survey is to the researcher is exemplified by a personal instance. One hymnal of which the writer was unaware turned up in the survey and served to solve the origin of a melody that had been the subject of a ten year search. It is for this reason that it might be wise, at a later date, to have a list of English Catholic hymnals, those of Capes (so far not found), Formby, the Oration hymnals, etc., are the source of a number of our American hymn tunes of earlier days.

The survey adds another major work to the small but helpful list of source book on American Hymnody. There is a great deal of pioneering work to be done and the Catholic University is the obvious place to initiate further research. Seemingly Sr. Camilla's

work is the first major result of the present interest and it is hoped that others of such primary importance will be forthcoming.

J. Vincent Higginson

---

## GREGORIAN CHANT

### *A History of the Controversy Concerning Its Rhythm.*

John Rayburn  
McLaughlin and Reilly Co.,  
252 Huntington Ave., Boston, Mass., 1964.  
90 pp. \$2.50

Dr. Rayburn traces the rhythmic problem through the decline of chant and its restoration, and adequately describes the triple disagreement since the restoration. Scholars will likely find lacunae, especially on the European side of the picture, but the book fulfills its purpose as stated in the forward admirably, and every chant teacher who does not wear blinkers will be happy to have it on his reference shelf. Cfr. editorial: *Gregorian Chant*.

---

## *Music*

## KYRIALE SIMPLEX

Editio Typica  
Typis Polyglottis Vaticanis, MCMLXV

Actually this is a view and not a re-view. I received the booklet only a few days ago (it was approved Dec. 14, 1964), but not published till a few weeks ago), and I have not had time to study the contents with the care they deserve. Frankly, I am disappointed, probably because I expected something quite different. What we got, instead of a really new collection of chants, is a handy assemblage of the easier chants already to be found in the Vatican Kyriale of 1905, supplemented and complemented by a few other chants that do not require an extensive practice by a skilled choir but are best suited to the needs of popular singing. Its avowed purpose is not to supplant the old Kyriale but to furnish simpler chants, in accordance with the desideratum of article 117 of the conciliar *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy*.

Perhaps a quick overview of the contents will help to explain the nature of the booklet.

First we have two versions of the *Asperges* and one of the *Vidi aquam*. The first version of the *Asperges* is the one marked

“*ad libitum*, I” in the older collection. No. 2 (and by the way, all the chants are numbered in the margin, to facilitate reference) is a new one, according to an Ambrosian melody, quite simple, but also quite nice. (Of course, I have not heard this done either by a choir or a congregation, so I can only gauge the effectiveness of a tune by my own ear!) The *Vidi aquam*, No. 3, is also a new tune, quite fluent.

The Kyriale proper is divided into five sets of Masses (the Ordinary parts), and four *Credo* tunes. Set I, nos. 4-7, is entirely from the old Kyriale; the *Kyrie* is the older # XVI, the *Gloria* is # XV and the *Sanctus-Benedictus* and *Agnus* are the familiar # XVIII. Set II, nos. 8-12, is a little different. There are two variant *Kyrie* melodies; the first is the old # XVIII, but the other, No. 9, is the melody at the beginning and end of the Litany of All Saints. The *Gloria* is new, a Spanish melody. The rest of the set is the older # XVI. Set III is almost entirely new. Again we have two *Kyrie* tunes; the first is discreetly not marked with a mode number, the second is in mode 1; both are new—I mean, have not, so far as I know, been published before. The *Gloria* is the well-known Ambrosian melody found in the *Liber* and other collections, but with an *Amen*, g-a, which can be used in place of the more ornate form; this is explained in the Foreword as a form that accords with germane tradition. The *Sanctus-Benedictus* is likewise Ambrosian, the *Agnus* a simple tune, repeated thrice, and again not marked with a mode indication. In the next set, nos. 18-23, one *Kyrie* and the *Gloria* are # XII, the *Sanctus-Benedictus* is (are?) the familiar # XIII (I’m glad that was included!), and the first set of melodies for the *Agnus* is the well-known tune marked in the Vatican “*ad libit. II*”, a simple tune repeated three times. But nos. 19, a new *Kyrie* and # 23, an *Agnus*, are now published for the first time. The last set, V, contains parts of the Vatican # X, which Father Vitry, I think, considered both eminently practical and beautiful (*Gloria*, *Sanctus-Benedictus* and *Agnus*), but it also includes two variant *Kyrie* tunes and a second *Agnus* tune.

The tunes for the *Credo* are the first three in the Vatican Kyriale, in that order, while the fourth, no. 36, is an Ambrosian composition, new to me. As an appendix the booklet adds two new tunes for the *Pater noster* for chanting when the prayer is sung by a crowd. Both melodies are new but quite clever; maybe they are traditional melodies from another tradition than the Roman, I do not know, but they certainly sing well, and have not the inherent difficulties of the usual missal tunes.

Francis A. Brunner, C.Ss.R.

## TEN CHORALE IMPROVISATIONS (Set II)

Paul Manz

Concordia Publishing House, St. Louis \$2.75

It becomes a little more difficult every day to compose music which has individuality, which is free of cliché, and which makes only modest demands on the performer. Dr. Manz has accomplished this task beautifully.

In all of these pieces there is a splendid quality of freshness and genuine character. Three should be singled out as being of unusually high quality: Praise to the Lord, the Almighty; "To Shepherds as They Watched by Night;" and "How Lovely Shines the Morning Star." These are all pieces of great charm and liveliness!

It is encouraging to find such music in the quarter-note jungle of current church music. Additional congratulations should go to Concordia for another superb job of engraving.

Myron J. Roberts, Professor of Organ  
University of Nebraska, Lincoln

---

### REPORT ON THIS SEASON'S CONCERT BY THE ROGER WAGNER CHORALE IN WASHINGTON, D.C.

On November 1, 1964, Roger Wagner brought his internationally famous Chorale and his Wicks baroque pipe organ to the Constitution Hall, on this occasion with a small orchestra. The auditorium was packed—evidence of the remarkably large following that Dr. Wagner enjoys in the capital city.

The program commenced with four short sacred selections: Victoria's *Ave Maria*, Palestrina's *Tu Est Petrus*, O Maria of Josquin des Prés, and *Benedictus* of Giovanni Gabrieli. The last piece was especially striking: the spacious, antiphonal effect achieved in the double choir galleries of St. Mark's Venice, was reproduced to some degree by the conductor's placing a small group of performers on each side of the auditorium. Gabrieli's setting, conceived in the superb *al fresco* style of Willaert's *chori spezzati* and incorporating a bold scheme of chordal progressions, was rendered with polish and vitality.

Three madrigals for triple chorus followed next: *Au Joly Jeu Du Pousse Avant* of Clement Jannequin and two works of Roland de Lassus: *Bonjour Mon Coeur* and *Le Rossignol*. Their position

between Gabrieli's *Benedictus* and *Handel's Organ Concerto V, Opus 4* made them sound even more lightweight than usual; they were the only secular choral pieces in the program and, for me at any rate, the only selections which did not properly fit the lofty tone set at the beginning of the concert. The *Handel organ concerto*, one of four which the composer wrote in F major, was played with art by Paul Manz. The first part of the program closed with Bach's motet for double chorus *Singet Dem Herrn*. Despite one or two lapses in precision, the Chorus's interpretation was vigorous and sensitive. Bach's seriousness and self-assertion were clearly manifest, as also was the profoundly religious quality of his music.

The second half of the concert was devoted entirely to a performance of Mozart's *Requiem* in D Minor, K. 626, composed in 1791 for the mysterious gray-clad emissary from the aristocratic plagiarist, Count Franz von Walsegg. Dr. Wagner's interpretation was in the grand manner: forceful, enthusiastic, and very energetic. As a result the work was well projected throughout the hall, though occasionally the meditative overtones in the score tended to be eclipsed in the sheer drive of Wagner's reading. The total effect was invigorating rather than funereal. Wagner's sense of cohesion and synthesis was finely exhibited throughout the work: I wonder how many members of the audience who had not been primed could tell where Mozart finishes and where Süssmayer begins.

Roger Wagner in this concert demonstrated once again that he is one of the most dynamic choral conductors in the United States today. My one regret is that he, and musicians like him, are forced (and I use the word advisedly) to perform the great music of Catholicism in the concert hall instead of in the church, for which it was, of course, composed. Liturgical music always loses something of its *mystique* and its solemnity when it is divorced from the ceremonial which it was intended to accompany. It is time that the United States hierarchy took effective steps to counteract the fact that the talents of the most outstanding executors of Catholic sacred music are imperfectly recognized within the Church and are almost always underrewarded. Surely it is ironic that most of the best Catholic church music performed in Washington, D.C., is not to be heard in the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception: one has to go to the Episcopalian Cathedral or to the Constitution Hall.

David Greenwood



## THE MESSAGE OF THE MASS MELODIES

John C. Murrett, M.M.

(Collegeville: The Liturgical Press, 1960)

xii, 173; \$2.00 (cloth)

It has taken me a long time to write this review because I became so fascinated with the book I had to read it several times, and some passages over and over again. The book, as its very name implies, studies the Gregorian melodies of the Mass propers—or rather, not studies but meditates them. For the book is a prayerful examination of the texts and plainsong tunes of the Sunday propers, plus a few outstanding feasts, done by a Maryknoll missionary stationed in Japan. It is not a technical study, but an effort to appreciate the treasures hidden both in the Latin text and the ancient chant. For this reason the book will be valuable even if the chant is no longer used at Mass. For the study of the texts is indeed a treat. Sometimes the reader may find the interpretation of the melodies far-fetched or at least very subjective; this is almost always true when one endeavors to translate melodic ideas into another medium. But not even the sharpest critic will find reason to carp at the discussion of the text, solid and never sentimental. I do not mean to belittle the melodic study. For every choirmaster this is most helpful, and while it will not supersede Dom Johnner's study, it will surely supplement it to advantage. Because of precious insights, little but discerning remarks that can only have come from long and loving contemplation of these texts and tunes, the book is, as I have already indicated, so fascinating that it is hard to put down. It is certainly not easy to write about some sixty propers without becoming tiringly repetitious; yet, in fact, the last pages of this book are as fresh and inspiring as the first. Choirmasters and singers will want to read it often—read it, and keep it at their side for further conning.

Francis A. Brunner, C.Ss.R.

---

### WANTED

Experienced Catholic Male Musician to direct a children's choir for special occasions and to direct congregational hymn singing and High Masses; also to sing for funerals and weddings. A full time position with good working conditions. State experience, age, and salary expected; also send photo of self. Position open in June, 1965. Write Caecilia, 3558 Cass St., Omaha, Nebraska, 6831.

## NEWS LITTER

● From the Anglican Church of the Advent in Boston's Beacon Hill area comes a noteworthy schedule of music for December, 1964 : Masses of Byrd (Four Voices) and Andrea Gabrieli (Brevis), communion services by a variety of Anglican composers, and a choice selection of motets and anthems in Latin and English by Purcell, Gibbons, Vittoria and Palestrina. The rector, Dr. Samuel J. Wylie, recently had these words of wisdom anent the liturgical changes in the Roman Catholic Church : "There is the possibility that Rome may go too far in the direction of simplicity. Majesty, mystery, and the dimension of glory are part of our worship, too. Cathedral churches and parishes both have a responsibility to honour the God Who transcends all human "folksiness" even though He hallows it . . . Pray that new reforms in worship in all communions may be saved from faddism and may fulfill their purpose of making the encounter between God and men more possible and total." **AH-MEN.**

● Another Episcopal rector, from St. Andrew's in Omaha, reminded his people recently that "traditionally, Christianity and music have been linked. Whether this union shall continue is a challenge to this century. Christians are called upon to recognize that we have an artistic responsibility which is inextricably involved with the powerful proclamation of the Gospel and with the expression of that necessary devotion which is the heart of worship". All of us could profit by heeding this reminder.

The musical program at St. Paul's Church of the Holy Childhood for the first four months of the current season is as much of a delight to the eye as it was to the ear. It included Masses by the likes of Langlais, Nibelle, Schubert, Woollen, Schroeder, Rheinberger, Lassus, Hassler, Haydn, Fissinger, Palestrina, Mozart and Faure (in order from October 11th last). A good selection of strong hymns and noteworthy organ music supplemented some choice offertory motets, representing men like Jaeggi, Pitoni, Hilber, Vittoria, Bruckner, Gallus, and Stravinsky. Choirmaster Richard Proulx continues to do well.

● Kirchenmusikdirektor Prof. George Trexler indicates that musica sacra is not all forgotten behind the Iron Curtain. On Oct. 3 last he conducted a sacred concert at the Thomaskirche in Leipzig honouring the 140th anniversary of Bruckner's birth, featuring the d minor Mass and the Te Deum, besides an original organ toccata based on the double fugue theme from the Amen of the e minor Mass Gloria. On the feast of Christ King, the six-part Palestrina Mass "Tu es Petrus" was sung in the University church, and on Nov. 21 another sacred concert in the Thomaskirche featured the Mozart Requiem. *Hoch soll der Professor leben!*

● Yes, Virginia, West Coast transplants can flourish in frigid New England. The sacred music series of St. Gabriel's Passionist monastery church in Brighton, Mass., is in its second year of weekly programs. Weekly organ recitals by Anthony Newman, monthly presentations of the Bach cantatas, and weekly chamber music concerts under the baton of James R. McCarthy provide musical fare for the parish. The program aims to bring the parish into closer contact with great music performed live for them in God's house, in surroundings befitting great religious music. Mr. McCarthy has some 83 boys in his choir-school and plans a professional concert career for them. Organist Anthony Newman, one of the great young talents in the country, has recently signed with the Roberta Bailey concert management. Watch for him—he's worth the hearing!

● More programs of ecumenical and musical interest:

From the Anglican Church of St. Mary the Virgin, New York City. James L. Palsgrove 3rd, Choirmaster. Service music as follows:

Oct. 4	Missa Festiva .....	Alexander Grechaninov
	O Lord I have loved the habitation .....	Thomas Tomkins
Oct. 11	Missa Tertii Toni .....	Costanzo Porta
	O God, thou art my God .....	Henry Purcell
Oct. 18	Missa Papae Marcelli .....	Palestrina
	O quam gloriosum .....	Vittoria
Oct. 25	Mass of the Bl. Sacrament .....	McNeif Robinson
	Exultate Deo .....	Francis Poulenc

No. 1	Missa Misericordias Domini O quam gloriosum	J. G. Rheinberger Juan Esquivel
Nov. 8	Mass in D Psallite Domino	M. A. Charpentier M. R. Delalande
No. 15	Missa Le bien que j'ai O sacrum convivium	Claude Goudimel Steffano Bernardi
Nov. 22	Messe e moll Out of the deep	Anton Bruckner Henry Aldrich
Nov. 29	Missa quinti toni Hosanna to the Son of David	Orlandus Lassus Orlando Gibbons

Also, each Sunday many quality psalms, canticles and motets for evensong by Tallis, Byrd, Morley, Farrant, Josquin, Reger, Handl, etc.

● From Grace Episcopal Church, Elmira, N. Y., Robert M. Finster, organist and choirmaster. Sunday evening sacred choral concerts by the Cantata Singers, after evensong.

Nov. 1	Missa Secunda	Hassler
Dec. 6	Cantata No. 61 "Nun komm der Heiden Heiland"	Bach

● A selection of the many Christmas programs of note in schools around the country includes the following:

Dec. 6. Winooski Park, Vt. The combined glee clubs of Trinity College and St. Michael's college, Dr. William Tortolano, conductor, presented parts two and five of the Bach Christmas Oratorio. (The chamber orchestra included two authentic oboes d'amore.) Conductor Tortolano has just received his Mus. D. from the University of Montreal with a thesis on "The Mass and the 20th Century Composer".

● Dec. 9, Winona, Minn. The College of St. Teresa string orchestra, triple trio and chorus performed the Christmas symphony of Sciassi, two Brahms songs, various carols, Randall Thompson's "Gate of Heaven", and a newly-composed work "The Shepherd's Carol" by Dr. Elizabeth Hollway. Paul Parthun conducts the college chorus.

● Dec. 10, Hastings, Nebr. St. Cecelia High School Girls' Choir, conducted by Sister Rosalie, O.P., offered the complete Britten Ceremony of Carols, plus Christmas anthems of Vittoria, Bach, dello Joio, and Menotti. Bravo, Sister!

● Dec. 12, Quincy, Ill. The Quincy college chorus, choir, glee club and orchestra, James M. Brinkman and Charles Winking, conductors, mounted a program which included the Jubilate Deo of G. Gabrieli for brass choir, carols, Randall Thompson's "Feast of Praise," and five excerpts from Messiah.

● Dec. 18, Milwaukee, Wis. The St. Francis Seminary band and choir, Rev. Elmer F. Pfeil, conductor, Michael J. Kenney, harpsichord, did the complete Bach cantata No. 142, "Uns ist ein Kind geboren" with chorus, soloists and harpsichord. D'Aquin noels and Anderson's Christmas Festival were the band contributions to a program distinguished by effective staging and novel lighting effects to illustrate the 12 Days of Christmas.

● Dec. 20, Marinette, Wis. The Central Catholic High School Choir and Chorale, Robert DeMille, conductor, offered various carols old and new from Bach and Praetorius through Vittoria to Britten and Paul Manz. Mr. DeMille's organization has a most impressive repertory for a high school group.

● Dec. 20, Milwaukee, Wis. De Sales Prep Seminary choir, Rev. Robert A. Skeris, conductor, performed ancient carols, the Dufay Gloria "ad modum tubae", and the Buxtehude cantata "Aperite Mihi Portas Justitiae", this last with an original orchestration for eleven piece wind band.

● A few examples of carol and Mass programs in various churches this past Christmas season:

St. Paul, Minn., Church of the Nativity, Rev. Richard J. Schuler, choirmaster.

The program included the Kronsteiner figured propers and Krippenmesse, and the Muttergottesmesse of Ernest Tittel (with orchestra).

Cincinnati, O., St. Bonaventure Church, Bonaventura double choir, Omer Westendorf, conductor . . . one hour of carols and excerpts from the English midnight Mass, sung in antiphonal style with choirs at opposite ends of the church, accompanied by organ and instruments. The date is significant and sensible: 3:30 p.m. on the Sunday after New Year's.

Jamaica, N. Y., Immaculate Conception Passionist monastery church. Dr. Robert Leech Bedell conducted the vested gallery choir of 140 men and boys in a program of carols and the Refice Missa Choralis. The propers were sung by 60 seminarians in the chancel.

Sheboygan, Wis., St. Clement's choir sang the Hassler Missa Secunda under conductor Paul L. Van de Weghe.

Norwalk, Calif., The 28 voice boys' choir of St. John of God church, conducted by minister of music Anthony Gril, sang not only at their home parish but at hospitals and military installations in the Long Beach area as well.

Milwaukee, Wis., St. John's Cathedral choir, Richard Weber, organist and choir-master, performed the Kodaly Missa Brevis with 40 piece orchestra.

St. Stanislaus and Holy Angels choirs, both conducted by Mrs. Dorothy Budish, each performed the Bruckner *C dur* Messe with orchestra, one at midnight and the other on Christmas Day.

Christ King Boys' and Men's choir, James A. Keeley, conductor, did the short parts of the Durufle Requiem with English text. Mr. Keeley's *Bel Canto* chorus also gave a performance of the Messiah in St. John's Cathedral with the Milwaukee Symphony, Harry John Brown conducting.

Combined choirs of Holy Ghost and St. John Vianney parishes presented a Bach cantata, conducted by Rev. Robert J. Novotny and Robert Stich, assisted by the Alverno College orchestra.

● Quincy College's indefatigable Dr. Lavern Wagner evidently has a good thing going—he has founded a Collegium Musicum to perform sacred and secular music of the Renaissance. Their concert last fall featured several works for brass, four Spanish tientos for recorder consort, and an *In Nomine* of Tomkins. Most elaborate works were two motets of Philippe Rogier, for double choruses of voices and winds. Recordings of these Quincy college performing groups are available.

● Somewhat the same thing is happening at Alverno College in Milwaukee. Under the expert leadership of Sister Theophane, students have constructed a harpsichord and a lute, and are now completing a virginal, on which they will soon be performing ancient music in a most authentic manner.

● Visiting in this country from March 15 to April 17 will be two distinguished Germans from Cologne, Msgr. Johannes Overath, council consultant and past head of the ACV, and Universitäts professor Dr. Karl Gustav Fellerer, whose recent *History of Catholic Church music* was Englished by Fr. Brunner. Since both men are intimately connected with the new *Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae*, purpose of their tour through South America, Mexico and the U. S. are to solicit members in the *Consociato* and contributors to its *Bulletin*, to discuss the state of music after the Council, to arrange for musicological publications, and to discuss what can be done for sacred music in Africa and India. Tentative plans call for visiting the Midwest and East, ending in New York during Holy Week.

● From the West Coast comes news of healthy musical activity. The latest project of Dr. Roger Wagner is a series of concerts by a new group he is forming, the Los Angeles Master Chorale and Sinfonia. Plans call for a major concert each month, beginning with the Bach *b minor* Mass in January. The Beethoven *Missa Solemnis*, a festival of 16th and 17th century music, and the West Coast premiere of Rossini's "Moses" are also on the docket. Judging by the sound of the first rehearsal, even this load will not be too much for the 80 professionals Dr. Wagner has chosen.

● Speaking of Roger Wagner, here are some details of the jubilee Mass of last June 14 when he received the K.C.S.G. papal decoration in recognition of 27 years service at St. Joseph's in Los Angeles: professional choir of 60 voices, past and present members of the Wagner Chorale, singing Roger's own St. Francis mass and "Alleluia" besides the Palestrina Super Flumina and the Vittoria Ave Maria, under the baton of Paul Salamunovich. Guest organist was Owen Brady of All Saints Episcopal in Beverly Hills.

● Easily the busiest Catholic church musician on the West Coast is Paul Salamunovich of Hollywood's Blessed Sacrament and St. Charles churches, among other places. This past Nov. 22 his St. Charles choir did a Kennedy memorial concert—the complete Duruffe Requiem. Reactions were uniformly enthusiastic, not only commending the splendid choral sound or the fine solo work of Jeannine Wagner and Ned Romero, but also the exceptionally effective registration (or should one say orchestration?) of organist Larry Robinson.

Mr. Salamunovich conducted a choir of 100 nuns celebrating the 75th anniversary of the Sister of the Holy Names in St. Vibiana's Cathedral on Jan. 9th. Cardinal MacIntyre presides, Bishop Manning preached, Msgr. Robert E. Brennan was deacon. Music was by Langlais, Staf Nees, and Flor Peeters (St. Joseph Mass and Psalm 99). Organist was Charles Fierro, and the Cardinal had special compliments for the conductor.

The clinic-and-workshop circuit also bears the imprint of Paul's dynamic Catholic musicianship. Wherever he goes he preaches the Gospel of chant and Renaissance polphony—and just in the next two months he is going to conduct the Virginia all-state at Portsmouth, the Houston High School festival, and the Alabama all-state at Tuscaloosa. Keep fighting the good fight, Paul.

● Late bulletin: Music program for the Patronal feast of St. Francis Seminary, Milwaukee, included the Missa Domus Aurea of Woollen, motets of De Klerk and Bruckner, and as recessional an elaborate arrangement of "Nun danket" involving choir, congregation, organ, and brass ensemble. Fr. Elmer Pfeil was responsible.

● On the educational front, these efforts have been significant: Detroit, Mich. The Palestrina Institute, led by Fr. Robert V. Ryan, is running a ten week series of evening classes for Catholic church musicians. The emphasis is to be practical, exploring how the new liturgy will affect the work of the musician on the parish level. Instructors besides Fr. Ryan include Prof. Malcolm Johns of Wayne State U., and Mr. Edward Higbee. May your classes be large!

Valparaiso, Ind. The 20th annual Valparaiso Church Music Seminar was held last Nov. 5-8. The general theme was "Criteria for Church Music—Traditional and Contemporary." Twelve European directors of church music from Germany, Holland and Norway were among the speakers.

Milwaukee, Wis. The St. Pius X Guild has already sponsored seven workshops in various localities throughout the diocese in October, November and January, to demonstrate materials and answer questions about the low Mass, the high Mass, and other occasional services in the vernacular. Evidently this traveling road-show program filled a need, for the total attendance was almost 1200 persons. Fr. Elmer F. Pfeil directed the activities.

North Easton, Mass. The music department of Stonehill College and the New England committee of the National Liturgical Conference sponsored a workshop on "Music in the Renewal of the Liturgy" last Nov. 11. One thousand New England priests and parish musicians attended. Dr. Alec Peloquin, addressing the afternoon general session, warned against "making a circus out of the sanctuary by processing to communion with something like 'When the Saints Go Marching In'." On the other hand, let's not present music which seems to suggest that we wish our congregations to be put to sleep. Music that is patchwork improvisation rather than whole cloth cannot be promoted as real or great art." Msgr. Russell Davis addressed the gathering on "Music in the Liturgy". He emphasized that "the choir has a most important part to play in today's new approach. It's function is not merely to dot the i's and cross the t's of the congregation. If the members of the choir are to come together for rehearsal of music in which they shall be joined by the congregation—and this they must do—they must be encouraged to some purely choral work, simple or elaborate, depending on circumstances.

● This is a point which may be overlooked by many in their laudable enthusiasm for congregational singing . . . Let us remember, too, that in all fairness and justice, the term "Latin language" is not a dirty term. Although we shall strive with all our might . . . to achieve the goal of the vernacular it does not mean that every piece of music ever written for the Latin tongue is to be shelved, as chant was for centuries, which only found its rebirth in the last decade."

## *Aims of the Society of Saint Caecilia*

1. To devote itself to the understanding and further propagation of the *Motu Proprio* "Inter Pastorales Officii Sollicitudines" of St. Pius X, Nov. 22, 1903; the constitution "Divini Cultum Sanctitatem" of Pius XI, Dec. 20, 1938; the encyclical "Mediator Dei" of Pius XII, Nov. 20, 1947; the encyclical "Musicae Sacrae Disciplina" of Pius XII, Dec. 25, 1955.
2. To seek the cultivation of Gregorian Chant, of Polyphony, of modern and especially contemporary music, of good vernacular hymns, of artistic organ playing, of church music research.
3. To foster all efforts toward the improvement of church musicians: choirmasters and choirs, organists, composers and publishers of liturgical music, and through all of these a sound musical approach to congregational participation.
4. To publish its journal, "Caecilia", and to establish a non-commercial repertory service.
5. To gain without fees, the following memberships:
  - a) Individual members (persons active in liturgical music)
  - b) Group members (an entire choir)
  - c) Sustaining members (subscribers to Caecilia)

*For further information write:*

CAECILIA, 3558 Cass St., Omaha 31, Nebr.

“Thus with the favor and under the auspices of the Church the study of sacred music has gone a long way over the course of the centuries. In this journey, although sometimes slowly and laboriously, it has gradually progressed from the simple and ingenious Gregorian modes to great and magnificent works of art. To these works not only the human voice, but also the organ and other musical instruments, add dignity, majesty and a prodigious richness.

The progress of this musical art clearly shows how sincerely the Church has desired to render divine worship ever more splendid and more pleasing to the Christian people. It likewise shows why the Church must insist that this art remain within its proper limits and must prevent anything profane and foreign to divine worship from entering into sacred music along with genuine progress, and perverting it.”

Pius XII—Mus. Sac. Disc.



**SUBSCRIPTION FORM**

Enclosed is \$3.00 for a year's subscription to *Caecilia*.

Send to:

Name .....

Address .....

City and State .....